HISTORY HERITAGE RESEARCH

Sue Rosen and Associates Pty Ltd ABN 42 053 393 598

srosen@suerosenassociates.com

- +61 2 9876 1655
- www.suerosenassociates.co
- 14 Crown Street, Epping NSW 2121, Australia

17 August 2022

Mr Steve Rubie Director Digital Place Solutions

Dear Mr Rubie,

Re: Heritage impact of signage proposed for M2 on Murray Farm Road Overpass

The Area

The Murray Farm Road overpass of the M2 is within the southern extremity of the Gullies Precinct of the Beecroft-Cheltenham Conservation Area on the Hornsby LEP. The inclusion of the area in the HCA is now an anomaly as it includes the M2, the boundaries of which were defined prior to the M2s construction. The M2 in this area runs beside a forested area of eucalypts, identified as Beecroft Park or Beecroft Reserve which in part includes a local landscape heritage item, No. 70 on the Hornsby LEP – "Bushland Reserve Beecroft and Cheltenham Parks" – the majority of which (Beecroft Park) is located to the west of the overpass with another component, Cheltenham Park is located further to the east adjoining Cheltenham Oval to the East.



Figure 1: The Murray Farm Road M2 overpass and environs. After crossing the Motorway, Murray Farm Road joins Kirkham Street which runs north to Beecroft Road. Devlin's Creek runs parallel to the motorway on its northern side, crossing to the southern side near the overpass. [Google Maps]

HISTORY HERITAGE RESEARCH

Sue Rosen and Associates Pty Ltd ABN 42 053 393 598

- +61 2 9876 1655
- 🗋 www.suerosenassociates.con
- 14 Crown Street, Epping NSW 2121, Australia



Figure 2: The Murray Farm Road M2 overpass and environs. Between Pennant Hills Road and the Beecroft Road overpass, the M2 is bordered on the north by the Pennant Hills Golf Club and Beecroft Park/Reserve, a residential subdivision, Cheltenham Oval and Park and Lynne Road Reserve. The south side is more densely subdivided but elements of intermittent bush remain along Devlin's Creek. [Google Maps]

The HCA



Figure 3: The Beecroft-Cheltenham Heritage Conservation Area. The site is located on the southern perimeter of The Gullies Precinct. The portion bordered in green is enlarged in **Figure 4.** [Hornsby DCP 2013] For a zoomable version see.

https://hscenquiry.hornsby.nsw.gov.au/temp/002_002_0E531JK108R_FYHCQRSK.PDF

2

HISTORY, HERITAGE AND RESEARCH SERVICES SINCE 1988

On Site, In Archives, With Communities, Across Landscapes

HISTORY HERITAGE RESEARCH

Sue Rosen and Associates Pty Ltd ABN 42 053 393 598

- srosen@suerosenassociates.com
- ∄ +61 2 9876 1655
- www.suerosenassociates.co
- 9 14 Crown Street, Epping NSW 2121, Australia



Figure 4: Extract from map of the Beecroft-Cheltenham Conservation Area. Proposed location of signage indicated by green encircled cross. The proposed site is within The Gullies Precinct – the southern most portion of the map HCA, defined prior to the construction of the M2 [Hornsby DCP 2013]

Nearby Heritage Items

A local landscape heritage item, No. 70 on the Hornsby LEP – "Bushland Reserve Beecroft and Cheltenham Parks" – exists in two separated parts to the north of the M2. Item 70 is located over:

Lots 537–539, DP 752028; Part Lot 540, DP 752028; Lots 541–544, DP 752028; Lot 931, DP 752028; which are located to the west of the overpass (Beecroft Park) and,

Lot 13, DP 842090 (Cheltenham Park) located on the eastern side of Cheltenham Oval to the east of the overpass. (See also Appendix A for listing and Schedule 5 of the LEP at https://legislation.nsw.gov.au/view/html/inforce/current/epi-2013-0569#sch.5)

HERITAGE

RESEARCH

HISTORY

Sue Rosen and Associates Pty Ltd ABN 42 053 393 598

- 🛛 srosen@suerosenassociates.com
- +61 2 9876 1655
- www.suerosenassociates.co
- 14 Crown Street, Epping NSW 2121, Australia



Figure 5: Item 70 as depicted on the Hornsby LEP Heritage Schedule is shown east of the Murray Farm Road overpass. However, aside from Cheltenham Park, the remainder of the item is west of the overpass. Although part of the official LEP as gazetted, the siting of the Item 70 on this plan appears to be in error. [https://eplanningdlprod.blob.core.windows.net/pdfmaps/4000_COM_HER_011_020_20130903.pdf]



Figure 6: The portion of Beecroft Park included in Item 70 on the Hornsby LEP Heritage Schedule. The M2 runs across the bottom of the figure. The overpass is out of view around the curve to the east. The above includes the following lots: Lots 541–544, DP 752028; Lot 931, DP 752028. It is assumed that the lots adjacent are also part of the Park but the lot and DP numbers of the listing have been superseded and not updated on the listing.

HISTORY HERITAGE RESEARCH

Sue Rosen and Associates Pty Ltd ABN 42 053 393 598

srosen@suerosenassociates.com

- +61 2 9876 1655
- www.suerosenassociates.com
- 9 14 Crown Street, Epping NSW 2121, Australia

The M2 From Pennant Hills Road to Beecroft Road Overpass

The M2 motorway east bound through Beecroft (northern side) and Epping (southern side) from the intersection with Pennant Hills Road approaches the Murray Farm Road overpass in a long gradually descending sweep through a series of curves. On both the north and south, from the Pennant Hills Road eastward entrance, the motorway is fringed by sound barriers and eucalypts, with a forested horizon. For the eastbound motorist, there are glimpses of the open lawns of the Pennant Hills Golf Club on the left. **Figure 7**



Figure 7: View from Pennant Hills Road access point.

HISTORY HERITAGE RESEARCH

Sue Rosen and Associates Pty Ltd ABN 42 053 393 598

srosen@suerosenassociates.com

- +61298761655
- www.suerosenassociates.com
 14 Crown Street Enging NSW 2121 Austra

Further east, after crossing Devlin's Creek the road curves to the south midway between Pennant Hills Road and Murray Farm Road, the sound barriers edge the road on both sides with dense trees/woodland above and behind the barriers. The view ahead for motorists is of sound barriers with forest framing the horizon and the motorway corridor. **Figure 8**



Figure 8: View along east along the motorway after crossing Devlin's Creek toward the curve in the distance.

HISTORY HERITAGE RESEARCH

Sue Rosen and Associates Pty Ltd ABN 42 053 393 598

☐ srosen@suerosenassociates.com

≝ +61 2 9876 1655 ∎

- www.suerosenassociates.com
- 14 Crown Street, Epping NSW 2121, Australia

As the overpass is approached, on the south, the road cuts though sandstone topped by sound barriers with shrubs in front and forest behind. On the northern side, the barriers continue for some distance until they become unnecessary with the natural topography and bush, shielding the line of road across a valley through which Devlin Creek flows. A chain wire fence runs along this section. **Figure 7**



Figure 7: View along east along the motorway the overpass can be seen in the distance on a curve in the line of road. on the left is item 70 of Schedule 5 on the Hornsby LEP

HISTORY HERITAGE RESEARCH

Sue Rosen and Associates Pty Ltd ABN 42 053 393 598

srosen@suerosenassociates.com

- +61 2 9876 1655
- พww.suerosenassociates.co
- 💡 14 Crown Street, Epping NSW 2121, Australia

The motorway is carried over a bridge crossing Devlin's Creek with forest visible on the northern side and high sound barriers on the south. The overpass dominates the horizon to the east. **Figure 8.**



Figure 8: A motorists view approaching the proposed site of the signage. The HCA and Item 70 is on the left. They eye of the motorist is drawn to the east by the line or road and the bridge.

The overpass obscures views of the HCA and forest. Figure 9.



Figure 9: Detail of immediate western approach to the proposed site of the signage.

HERITAGE RESEARCH

HISTORY

Sue Rosen and Associates Pty Ltd ABN 42 053 393 598

- srosen@suerosenassociates.com
- 🗒 +61 2 9876 1655
- www.<u>suerosenassociates.co</u>
- **Q** 14 Crown Street, Epping NSW 2121, Australia



Figure 10: The view experienced passing through the underpass and under the proposed sign.

The eastern façade of the bridge is covered by paneling to half the height of the safety fencing, well above the handrail. **Figure 11:**



Figure 11: Motorists view in the rear-view mirror after passing through the underpass.

To the east of the overpass the line of road runs briefly through sandstone cuttings on the on north topped by trees, a chain wire fence and then sound barriers on the north. On the southern side high sound barriers consistently edge the road from then on, both before and after the bridge.

history, heritage and research services since 1988 On Site, In Archives<u>, With Communities, Across Landscapes</u>

HISTORY HERITAGE RESEARCH

Sue Rosen and Associates Pty Ltd ABN 42 053 393 598

srosen@suerosenassociates.com

- +61 2 9876 1655
- ک www.suerosenassociates.cc
- 14 Crown Street, Epping NSW 2121, Australia

Within a short distance high sound walls border the line of road on both sides until the next overpass and beyond. Trees, increasingly thinly are evident over the top of the walls. **Figure 12.**



Figure 12: The line of road is increasingly delineated by sound barriers after passing through the underpass.

HISTORY HERITAGE RESEARCH

Sue Rosen and Associates Pty Ltd ABN 42 053 393 598

☐ srosen@suerosenassociates.com

- +61 2 9876 1655
- 🗋 www.suerosenassociates.co
- 💡 14 Crown Street, Epping NSW 2121, Australia

Site Photos



Figure 13: Approach to the overpass from northern (Beecroft) side.



Figure 14: Approach to the overpass from northern (Beecroft) side. Focus on eastern façade. Note screening that extends to handrail height.

HISTORY HERITAGE RESEARCH

Sue Rosen and Associates Pty Ltd ABN 42 053 393 598

- 🛛 srosen@suerosenassociates.com
- +61 2 9876 1655
- www.suerosenassociates.cc
- 💡 14 Crown Street, Epping NSW 2121, Australia



Figure 15: Approach to the overpass from southern (Epping) side.



Figure 16: View from overpass west along motorway, with HCA and part of Heritage Item 70 on right. The sign will hang below the point from which this image was taken.

12

HISTORY HERITAGE RESEARCH

Sue Rosen and Associates Pty Ltd ABN 42 053 393 598

- srosen@suerosenassociates.com
- +61 2 9876 1655
- www.suerosenassociates.co
- 💡 14 Crown Street, Epping NSW 2121, Australia



Figure 17: Screening on eastern façade that obscures views.



Figure 18: Close up view of Item 70 from near the emergency stopping bay on the M2.

HISTORY HERITAGE RESEARCH

Sue Rosen and Associates Pty Ltd ABN 42 053 393 598

- srosen@suerosenassociates.com
- +61 2 9876 1655
- 🕅 www.suerosenassociates.co
- 14 Crown Street, Epping NSW 2121, Australia



Figure 19: Item 70 is very densely vegetated. Track near the motorway have been blocked off – public access is now on the high ground above.



Figure 20: In the centre of the image there is a glimpse of the overpass approximating where the sign will be located. This photo was taken well down the slope and off the track. 12

HISTORY HERITAGE RESEARCH

Sue Rosen and Associates Pty Ltd ABN 42 053 393 598

srosen@suerosenassociates.com

- +61 2 9876 1655
- 🗋 www.suerosenassociates.co
- 💡 14 Crown Street, Epping NSW 2121, Australia

The Proposal



Figure 21: Indicative sign design and proportions in relation to the overpass. Note that the sign is in line with the screening on the eastern façade and below the handrail. Views from the overpass and to the HCA and Item 70 will not be impacted by its construction.

Heritage Impacts

While the site for the proposed signage is within the vicinity of the HCA and item 70 on the HELP it will not obscure views to the HCA or heritage item because it will be sited low on the overpass and will not add further visual obstructions that those posed by the existing overpass structure. Motorists will have the HCA and Item 70 on their left as they travel east. The sign will not impede their views of the Heritage.

Given that:

- the sign will not impede views to Item 70 or to the HCA from the M2 or the overpass, and
- the minimal visibility *from* the HCA and heritage item 70

It is my opinion there will be no negative impacts on the character of the conservation area or item 70 and therefore approval should not be withheld on heritage grounds.

Yours sincerely

Sur Rosen

Dr Sue Rosen Director 17 August 2022

15

HISTORY HERITAGE RESEARCH

Sue Rosen and Associates Pty Ltd ABN 42 053 393 598

∃ srosen@suerosenassociates.com

+61 2 9876 1655

www.suerosenassociates.cor

14 Crown Street, Epping NSW 2121, Australia

APPENDIX A – HERITAGE LISTING

Council



Community Property Lifestyle Environment Business Library



Massassas

https://hscenquiry.hornsby.nsw.gov.au/pages/xc.track.heritage/heritage.aspx?id=23410

Heritage Register

	Tientage Register
manayement.	Identify potential seed sources for propagation and future restoration programs. For further detailed assessment of health, condition and tree management recommendations, a qualified arborist should be
	consulted.
Endorsed	Local
Significance:	
Criteria c) Aesthetic:	Aesthetic/ visual significance (local neighbourhood/ streetscape)
Criteria f) Rarity:	Item possesses rare or endangered aspects of NSW's natural history (EPBC Act 1999 and TSC Act 1993). Remnant native canopy species (BGHF scheduled under EPBC & TSC Acts)
Criteria	Item is important in demonstrating the principal characteristics of a class of natural places or natural
g)Representative:	enviroments. Ecological/ biodiversity and genetic values (including faunal habitat)
Heritage Listings:	Hornsby Local Environmental Plan 2013 - Schedule 5
Conservation Area:	Beecroft / Cheltenham HCA
References:	Hornsby Shire Council, Biodiversity Conservation Strategy 2006 Smith, P & Smith, J. Native Vegetation
	Communities of Hornsby Shire, 2007 Native Vegetation of the Cumberland Plain DE&CC (NSW) 2002 Scientific Committee - final determinations, DE&CC (NSW), 2007 Benson, D & Howell, J. (1994) Cunninghamia 3(4): 677-780 Benson, D & McDougall, L. (1998) Cunninghamia 5(4): 808-983 Benson, D &
	Howell, J. (1990) Taken for Granted. (Kangaroo Press)
Study:	Heritage Review 4 (2008)
Study by:	Landarc Pty w Patrick O'Carrigan & Partners
Study Inventory No.:	004
Previous Studies:	Hornsby Shire Heritage Study, Perumal Murphy Wu Pty Ltd for Hornsby Shire Council and the NSW
	Department of Planning (1993) [Survey by: Ashton, W 26.03.1993]
Comments:	Heritage listed in HSLEP 1994, Gazetted July 1994. Heritage listing reviewed in Heritage Review 4 (2008).
Date Inspected:	12-Jul-2007
Images:	View of bushland between Nos. 10-14 Castle Howard Road (unmade road section).
-	
	A A A A A A A A A A A A A A A A A A A
	The second s
	and the second
	the state have been all the set
- /	/beritage aspy?id=23410

 $https://hscenquiry.hornsby.nsw.gov.au/pages/xc.track.heritage/heritage.aspx?id=\!23410$

Heritage Register



Lat/Long: